



Long Beach Police Efficiency Study

September 4, 2007

Laura L. Doud, City Auditor

GOAL OF LONG BEACH POLICE EFFICIENCY STUDY

- Identify potential efficiencies, cost savings and best use of resources to ensure the continued success and excellence of the police department
- Find ways to increase the number of officers on patrol
- Actively work with all stakeholders, including the Police Department and City Manager to monitor the progress of implementation

OVERVIEW

■ Identified 12 efficiency initiatives within four broad categories:

- 1) Civilianization
- 2) Redeployment
- 3) Technology
- 4) Fine Enforcement

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative One

CIVILIANIZATION

- In the past, LBPD has successfully placed civilians in management and staff positions which increased the number of officers on patrol
- Additional opportunities for expanded civilianization remain
- Audit identified 23 positions that could potentially be occupied by qualified civilian personnel

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative One

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS:

- Analyze each unit and determine if operational requirements could be met with fewer sworn officers
- Explore additional opportunities for civilianization

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative One

continued

COST DIFFERENTIAL: OFFICERS v. CIVILIANS

	Lieutenants	Sergeant	Corporals	Officers	Cumulative Diff.
Community Relations		3	1	4	\$208,837
Information Technology	1	2		2	167,388
Fleet			1		25,782
Physical Fitness			1		25,782
Range				1	17,247
Business Desk Jail Division				1	17,247
Communications	1				56,850
Management of Criminal Investigations		1		4	<u>122,041</u>
Total					\$620,381

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative One

continued

FISCAL IMPACT/SAVINGS:

Assumes:

- 10% discount for imperfect substitution*
- Full implementation is not completed until the end of the first quarter*
- Savings increases by 3% each year to account for inflation*

	FY2008	FY2009	FY2010	FY2011	FY2012
Discount %	35%	10%	10%	10%	10%
Fiscal Impact	\$403,000	\$575,000	\$592,000	\$610,000	\$628,000

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative One

continued

NO civilianization of light duty positions performed by officers who are hurt or disabled is recommended

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Two

REDEPLOYMENT

- 180,000 calls for service annually – three priority levels
- 33.8% of all dispatches – 60,000 dispatches annually are PRIORITY THREE calls (*mainly “reporting” – non emergencies*)
- Average of 34 minutes for each PRIORITY THREE call per officer
- 34,000 hours of time diverted from patrol
- Equivalent to 21 officers or approximately \$2.2 million annually

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Two

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS:

- Establish a call-taking unit staffed by retired officers, trained civilians and cadets

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Three

CYCLE NON-PATROL OFFICERS THROUGH PATROL

- Increases patrol officer presence and contains overtime created by extended shifts and call backs
- Significant variations in overtime usage exist within the Investigations Bureau
- Complete workload analysis should be conducted to identify positions to be cycled through patrol
- Will not compromise other crime fighting duties

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Three

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS:

- Consider implementing a system to cycle non-patrol officers through patrol to reduce call-back overtime associated with meeting minimum staffing levels

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Four

CONTAIN OVERTIME THROUGH TEMPORARY OFFICER REASSIGNMENT

- Minimum one officer to each of the 24 beats, 24 hours a day
- Multiple officers are assigned to some beats
- Currently, officers on a beat that exceed the minimum staffing target are shifted to an understaffed beat only if within the same division
- By reassigning officers from another division, reduces costs of “call-back” overtime to fill the understaffed beat
- Five of the comparable cities in California have also instituted the use of temporary reassignment
- Potential impacts on Community Policing program should be considered

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Four

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS:

- To contain overtime, consider reassigning officers, who are already working their normally scheduled shifts, to the other understaffed division

FISCAL IMPACT/SAVINGS:

- Over 31,000 overtime hours expected in 2007
- Average officer overtime rate - \$55.21 per hour
- Assume 25% overtime reduction – based on comparable cities
- Cost Savings – over \$430,000 annually

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Five

REVIEW SPECIALIZED UNITS WITHIN CONTEXT OF MORE COMPREHENSIVE REVIEW OF OFFICER DEPLOYMENT

- The structure of the Special Enforcement Details and Units indicates that there may be opportunities for consolidation or reduction depending on caseloads and work functions of the members of these units
- Fiscal impact of such an evaluation is yet to be determined

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Five

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATION:

- Perform a comprehensive review of specialized units and determine whether there are opportunities to consolidate or reduce units
- Opportunities may also exist to consolidate administrative staff

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Six

TECHNOLOGY UPGRADES

- Improve Record Management Systems
- Improve Automated Field Reporting System
- Share information across all required reports in order to eliminate multiple data entry (e.g., name search, vehicle search, etc.)
- 15,000 patrol hours gained based on audit analysis
- Equivalent of 7 sworn officers

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Six

continued

Estimated Fiscal Impact:

Equivalent of Seven Sworn Officers

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Six

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATION:

- Customize systems to improve data collection, to eliminate the need for duplicate data entry and to increase officer productivity

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Seven

ADOPT AUTOMATED TIMEKEEPING SYSTEMS

- Timecards currently entered manually
- Set default hours in the system so that only changes to regularly scheduled hours will have to be entered

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Seven

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATION:

- Explore the costs and use of a Citywide automated timekeeping system which will include the LBPD

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Eight

SHARE INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY SERVICES AND TECHNOLOGY STRATEGY

- Currently, parallel structures exist in the Police Department's Technology Services Division and the City's Technology Service Department

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Eight

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATION: LBPD can achieve greater efficiency and costs savings within its Technology Services Division by:

- Increasing use of services offered by the City's Department of Technology Services
- Greater coordination and collaboration between LBPD and Technology Services
- Exploring expanded use of Mobile Data Computers in police cars to file reports

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Eight

continued

FISCAL IMPACT/SAVINGS:

- Savings from this initiative are not quantifiable, but greater efficiency will expand available resources
- Additionally, LBPD has a \$2.9 million budget for information services that could be potentially reduced as a result of better coordination

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Nine

IMPROVE CLARITY AND TIMELINESS OF OVERTIME AND OTHER FINANCIAL/HUMAN RESOURCE INFORMATION AND REPORTING

- Consistently reporting and monitoring overtime costs will help to better manage and control overtime as well as target areas requiring greater personnel

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Nine

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS:

- Establish systems and protocols to enhance overtime reports and regularly report overtime costs by category

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Ten

FALSE ALARMS/FINE ENFORCEMENT

- City allows two false alarms in a year at no charge
- Below fee of comparable jurisdictions
- False alarms drain valuable resources from the Police Department
- False alarm fines provide an incentive to the alarm user to operate the system properly

Please refer to chart on page 24 of report

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Ten

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATION:

➤ Re-evaluate false alarm policy to include:

--Instituting a charge for the second false alarm within a year

--Increasing false alarm fines to the comparable average

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Eleven

INSTITUTE BOOTING AND TOWING POLICY

- City currently tows vehicles with 5 or more unpaid parking tickets
- 413,000 parking tickets issued in 2006
- \$4.4 million in parking ticket revenue
- Approximately \$1.0 million goes uncollected every year

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Eleven

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATION:

- To improve the City's collection rate and more fully recoup the costs of the City's parking program, institute a booting program to be used in combination with the towing program
 - Lower cost alternative than towing
 - Supplement to the current towing program
 - Lower threshold of unpaid tickets
 - Allows the City to collect revenue faster

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Eleven

continued

FISCAL IMPACT/SAVINGS OF BOOTING:

- Estimated 13,000 vehicles with over 7 delinquent parking tickets
- Estimated at \$7.8 million in unpaid tickets
- 20% “boot” rate of the 13,000 vehicles in the first year (FY 2008)
- Estimate the City can collect 30% of the \$1.0 million in uncollected parking ticket revenue in future years

Please refer to chart on page 28 of report

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Twelve

CONDUCT A COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS ON CONTRACTING OUT PARKING ENFORCEMENT

- Civilian officers currently assigned to Parking Enforcement
- Number of civilian officers may be too limited to maximize enforcement and revenue generating potential

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Twelve

continued

AUDIT RECOMMENDATION:

- Analyze the costs and benefits of transferring parking enforcement with updated parking and traffic technology

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Twelve

continued

FISCAL IMPACT/SAVINGS:

- Parking Enforcement currently employs:
 - 12 Security Officer II positions – fully loaded cost of \$66,422
 - 1 Security Officer IV position – fully loaded cost of \$78,686
 - TOTAL PERSONNEL COST = \$875,000
- Estimate to contract out: \$600,000

Estimated Savings: \$275,750

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Initiative Twelve

continued

- One of the nation's largest providers of private parking enforcement services estimated that a city the size of Long Beach should be issuing approximately 137,000 more parking tickets annually in order to adequately enforce parking regulations
- **This would generate an estimated \$1.5 million annually**
- This initiative has been discounted 50% in FY 2008 to allow for possible contract negotiations

Please refer to chart on page 30 of report

CITY AUDITOR RECOMMENDATION FOR ALL INITIATIVES

Request City Council to direct the City Manager, Police Department and other relevant departments to review recommendations, develop comprehensive strategies consistent with these recommendations and advise the City Council and City Auditor as to progress and plans for implementation in 90 days, six months and one year from the date of receipt and filing.

CLOSING

- Success of this audit is due in large part to the help and cooperation received from the Long Beach Police Department
- Recommendations will achieve the stated goal of maintaining excellence while simultaneously identifying potential cost savings for the City's general fund
- The City Auditor's Office will actively work with City management to monitor the implementation of these initiatives and their potential adoption into the upcoming budget cycles